January 18, 2019

Proposal Evaluation Summary
Classification & Compensation Study – RFP #PUR1018-072
Proposals opened November 9, 2018
Evaluators: Chelsea Archibald, Assistant Human Resources Director; Teresa Feldmann, Human Resources Director; Sandi Fowler, Deputy City Manager; Casey Drew, Finance Director

Proposals received (in alphabetical order):

Firm Name	Location	Financial Proposal	Total Score (shortlisted firms)
The Archer Company	Rock Hill, SC	$84,950	534.20
Carlson Dettmann	Middleton, WI	$195,000	618.46
Evergreen Solutions	Tallahassee, FL	$59,500	471.60
Gallagher	Minneapolis, MN	$110,000	
Lockton Companies	St. Louis, MO	Itemized	
MGT Consulting Group	Sacramento, CA	$57,000	480.00
Newport Group	Cedar Rapids, IA	$129,000	
Public Sector Personnel Consultants	Tempe, AZ	$142,500	
RSM	Cedar Rapids, IA	$157,000	
Segal Waters Consulting	Washington, DC	$195,000	778.46
Springsted Inc.	St. Paul, MN	$109,700/$144,200	

Top two ranked firms:

1. **Carlson Dettmann**

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (40%)	280.00
Financial Proposal (20%)	58.46
Responsiveness (40%)	280.00
Local Preference Points	n/a
Total Evaluation Points	618.46

Facts:
*   Firm possesses extensive experience providing a full range of human resource assistance to public, private, and not-for-profit organizations
*   Proposal clearly presents specific experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project, including project leads with past experience as human resource executives in the public sector
*   Recommend City's human resource staff participate with project team for evaluation of benchmark classifications that will be the basis of base salary survey work
*   Firm will provide an appropriate license to the City at no additional cost so the City can conduct its own evaluation work in the future
*   Emphasize continuous communication with employees at all steps of the process
*   Encourage an appeal process as critical to the validity and acceptance of the process
*   Financial proposal is within competitive range
*   Clear understanding of project with detailed timeline and proven success on similar projects

2. **Segal Waters Consulting**

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (40%)	360.00
Financial Proposal (20%)	58.46
Responsiveness (40%)	360.00
Local Preference Points	n/a
Total Evaluation Points	778.46

Facts:
- Firm specifically focuses on human resources consulting services for the public sector
- Extensive experience with public sector compensation and classification analysis and design for similar municipal organizations
- Proposal clearly presents specific experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project, all of whom have past experience working in the public sector
- Project will include 100 benchmark job titles
- Significant focus on employee involvement
- All data used and collected for the study will be provided to and owned by the City
- City will retain perpetual access to all tools used for this project for no additional cost
- Financial proposal is within competitive range and includes appeal process
- Clear understanding of project with detailed timeline and proven success on similar projects
- Most thorough and responsive proposal in addressing the various aspects of the RFP

Recommendation for Award:

The evaluation team scored the top ranked proposals and Segal Waters Consulting was rated as the top proposal. A resolution will be presented to the City Council on January 22, 2019 recommending that the contract be awarded to Segal Waters Consulting.